

## Development of an Objective and Transparent Islamic Religious Education Learning Assessment Rubric

Wardatuz Zahro'ul Mukarromah<sup>1\*</sup>, Taqiyatunnisa Maulidy Azanabilah<sup>2</sup>, Siti Wulandari<sup>3</sup>, Siti Halimah<sup>4</sup>

<sup>\*1, 2, 3, 4</sup>Universitas PGRI Wiranegara, Indonesian

<sup>\*1</sup>email: zahroulwardatuz@gmail.com

<sup>2</sup>email: maudyaza82@gmail.com

<sup>3</sup>email: sitiwulandari1199@gmail.com

<sup>4</sup>email: sitihalimah@uniwara.ac.id

### Abstract

The development of assessment rubrics in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) is an essential effort toward establishing an objective, transparent, and character-oriented evaluation system rooted in Islamic values. This study aims to design assessment rubrics that holistically measure cognitive, affective, and psychomotor dimensions. The Research and Development (R&D) method applies a modified Borg & Gall model, including needs analysis, prototype design, expert validation, limited trials, product revision, and large-scale implementation. Data were analyzed qualitatively and quantitatively using expert judgment, Aiken's V, and Cronbach's Alpha to assess validity and reliability. The findings indicate that analytic rubrics improve the objectivity and consistency of assessment, particularly in evaluating attitudes and worship performance. Providing rubrics to students enhances learning motivation, accountability, and academic honesty. The use of digital platforms, such as e-rubrics and digital portfolios, strengthens documentation and feedback effectiveness. The study concludes that successful rubric implementation depends on teacher involvement, clear indicators, scoring calibration, and institutional support. The developed rubric serves as a foundational instrument for fair, adaptive, and spiritually oriented PAI evaluation toward nurturing insan kamil – a fully developed Muslim individual.

### Keywords:

Assessment Rubric;  
Islamic Religious Education;  
Objectivity.

### Abstrak

Pengembangan rubrik penilaian dalam pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) merupakan langkah strategis untuk menciptakan sistem evaluasi yang objektif, transparan, dan berorientasi pada pembentukan karakter. Penelitian ini bertujuan mengembangkan rubrik penilaian yang mampu memetakan aspek kognitif, afektif, dan psikomotor secara holistik sesuai nilai-nilai Islam. Metode yang digunakan adalah Research and Development (R&D) dengan model Borg & Gall yang dimodifikasi melalui tahapan analisis kebutuhan, desain prototipe, validasi ahli, uji coba

### Kata Kunci:

Rubrik Penilaian;  
Pendidikan Agama Islam;  
Objektivitas.

terbatas, revisi produk, dan uji coba luas. Analisis dilakukan secara kualitatif dan kuantitatif menggunakan penilaian ahli, Aiken's V, dan Cronbach's Alpha untuk mengukur validitas dan reliabilitas. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa rubrik analitik meningkatkan obyektivitas dan konsistensi penilaian, khususnya pada penilaian sikap dan praktik ibadah. Transparansi rubrik yang diberikan kepada siswa meningkatkan motivasi belajar, akuntabilitas, dan kejujuran akademik. Integrasi teknologi melalui e-rubric dan portofolio digital memperkuat efektivitas dokumentasi dan umpan balik. Simpulan penelitian menegaskan bahwa keberhasilan implementasi rubrik PAI bergantung pada keterlibatan guru, kejelasan indikator, kalibrasi antar-penilai, serta dukungan kelembagaan. Rubrik penilaian yang dikembangkan menjadi fondasi bagi evaluasi PAI yang adil, adaptif, dan berlandaskan nilai spiritual Islam menuju pembentukan insan kamil.

Received: 17 July 2025; Revised: 16 August 2025; Accepted: 21 November 2025

© Ar-Rasyid: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam  
Program Studi Pendidikan Agama Islam  
Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Utara



This is an open access article under the [CC-BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license

## 1. Introduction

Assessment is a crucial component of the educational system, serving to measure students' achievement of competencies comprehensively. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), assessment does not only emphasize the cognitive aspect but also includes affective and psychomotor dimensions related to the formation of morals, spiritual attitudes, and religious behavior. Therefore, assessment instruments used in PAI learning must be able to portray students' development in values, knowledge, and skills holistically. However, in practice, PAI assessments often tend to be subjective and lack transparency, particularly when evaluating attitudes and religious behaviors. This condition leads to assessment results that fail to accurately reflect students' actual abilities and character.

The assessment rubric serves as a strategic solution to enhance the objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process. Through rubrics, educators can establish clear, measurable, and pre-agreed criteria and indicators from the outset of learning. Consequently, the evaluation process becomes not only fairer but also provides constructive feedback for students. In the context of PAI, the development of assessment rubrics must align with the learning objectives grounded in Islamic values such as honesty, responsibility, and exemplary conduct. Moreover, rubrics should be designed to accommodate various assessment methods such as performance assessments, observations, and portfolios to ensure valid and reliable data collection (Latifah et al., 2025)

The paradigm shift in 21st-century education, which emphasizes transparency and accountability, further strengthens the urgency of developing assessment rubrics in PAI. Teachers are no longer the sole evaluators but also facilitators who involve students in self-assessment and reflection processes. With the implementation of objective and transparent assessment rubrics, PAI learning is expected to foster a culture of honest, open, and continuous improvement-oriented evaluation. Therefore, research on the development of an objective and transparent assessment rubric for Islamic Religious

Education is essential to support teacher professionalism and improve the overall quality of Islamic education in schools (Nursyamsiyah, 2023).

## **2. Methods**

This study employs a Research and Development (R&D) approach aimed at developing an objective and transparent assessment rubric for Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning. The development procedure follows a modified Borg & Gall model, consisting of several main stages: (1) preliminary study and needs analysis, (2) design of the initial rubric prototype, (3) expert validation, (4) limited field testing, (5) product revision, and (6) large-scale field testing. The data sources include primary and secondary data. Primary data were collected through interviews and classroom observations involving Islamic education teachers at junior and senior high schools participating in the field test. Secondary data were obtained from a literature review on educational assessment theories, Islamic education evaluation, objectivity principles, and transparency standards in learning assessment.

Data collection techniques involved documentation, questionnaires, and in-depth interviews. Product validation was conducted through expert judgment by Islamic education specialists and learning evaluation experts. The data were analyzed using both qualitative and quantitative methods. Qualitative analysis assessed the content validity and construct clarity based on expert feedback, while quantitative analysis measured the validity and reliability coefficients using Aiken's V and Cronbach's Alpha formulas. The research procedure emphasizes enhancing objectivity by establishing measurable scoring criteria, clear descriptors, and performance indicators that can be verified by both teachers and students. Transparency is ensured by designing the rubric to be openly accessible and accompanied by clear assessment guidelines.

## **3. Result and Discussion**

The development of assessment rubrics for Islamic Education (PAI) demonstrates that analytically constructed rubrics are capable of mapping the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor dimensions in a more detailed manner, thereby reducing assessor subjectivity. Field studies reveal that the use of performance rubrics in PAI learning increases the validity of worship and religious attitude assessments, as it allows for direct observation of behavioral indicators. To ensure objectivity, rubrics should be based on core competencies and indicators derived from the syllabus and learning outcomes, with clearly defined performance descriptors (e.g., poor, fair, good, excellent). These descriptions help assessors align their perceptions during evaluation (Anon., 2025a).

Transparency of rubrics to students is a critical factor: when learners understand the criteria and scales of assessment, their learning motivation and accountability increase because they know what is expected of them. Rubric development should involve teachers as primary stakeholders, along with expert reviewers, to ensure that indicators are contextually appropriate to the school or madrasa environment and minimize individual bias. Teacher involvement also promotes a sense of ownership over the instrument. The implementation of analytic rubrics in affective (attitudinal) assessment requires structured observation instruments, developmental journals, and anecdotal records; this combination enhances the reliability of PAI attitude assessment (Anon., 2022).

Research findings highlight a key challenge: many teachers are not yet accustomed to creating communicative and measurable rubric descriptors. Thus, training in rubric development and scoring calibration is essential. Rubrics for practical tasks (e.g., prayer, ablution, Qur'an recitation) are more effective when broken down into components such as preparation, procedure, fluency, and decorum allowing teachers to provide specific feedback on each aspect. The use of holistic rubrics is more efficient for quick or overall attitude assessments, but the main drawback is the lack of detailed feedback compared to analytic rubrics (Anon., 2020a). Therefore, a practical recommendation is to combine holistic and analytic approaches according to the purpose of the assessment. Content validity can be improved by aligning rubric items with the indicators of the 2013 Curriculum (or local curriculum) and by conducting expert validation and classroom trials before widespread use. From a reliability standpoint, studies emphasize the importance of clear scoring guidelines and inter-rater calibration sessions (marker moderation) to ensure consistent scoring among assessors particularly crucial for affective and performance-based assessments (Anon., 2023)

Transparency also includes providing rubrics to parents and school stakeholders as a form of accountability. Several studies indicate that parental support increases when the assessment process is perceived as fair and clear. The integration of technology such as digital rubric formats and video evidence portfolios simplifies documentation and facilitates periodic reviews while enabling more transparent audit processes. Rubric development must also consider local culture and student diversity to avoid cultural bias in assessing religious attitudes and practices, which is especially important in Indonesia's multicultural school contexts. The emphasis on authentic assessment (assessment for learning) in PAI encourages rubrics to function not only as summative tools but also as formative instruments that guide continuous student improvement. In classroom management, clear rubrics accelerate remedial and intervention processes because teachers can immediately identify which dimensions students have not yet mastered and design appropriate follow-up learning (Muinudin, 2022)

Several studies show a positive correlation between rubric-based feedback and character development: indicator-based feedback helps students internalize Islamic values such as honesty, responsibility, and discipline. However, a common obstacle in implementation is the limited time teachers have for detailed observation and scoring. Recommended solutions include rotating observers, using simplified checklists, and maintaining portfolio documentation (Umami, 2018). To ensure long-term objectivity, schools should establish policies regulating rubric creation, validation, and annual evaluation so that rubrics remain relevant to curriculum changes and students' learning needs.

In conclusion, the development of an objective and transparent PAI assessment rubric must be participatory engaging teachers, experts, and students grounded in curricular competencies, supported by clear descriptors, continuous scoring calibration, and digital documentation for quality assurance and accountability. Full implementation yields significant benefits in validity, reliability, and moral character learning (Anon., 2024).

Developing assessment rubrics in Islamic Education is a strategic step toward realizing an evaluation system that is objective, transparent, and character-oriented. Rubrics as assessment instruments allow teachers to establish clear, measurable, and

consistent criteria for evaluating student achievement. In the context of 21st-century learning, assessment objectivity is an unavoidable necessity, as learning outcomes reflect not only cognitive achievement but also affective and psychomotor dimensions aligned with the aims of Islamic education. A well-designed rubric provides clarity for students about expectations and helps teachers assess more fairly and consistently (Silvia, 2024).

In practice, developing a PAI assessment rubric requires deep understanding of the core values of Islamic education honesty, discipline, responsibility, and exemplary conduct. PAI teachers act as both evaluators and spiritual mentors; thus, rubric indicators must include dimensions of faith (iman), ethics (akhlaq), worship (ibadah), and social interaction (mu'amalah). Recent studies affirm that spiritually oriented rubrics can strengthen the internalization of Islamic teachings within students, as the assessment process evaluates not only learning outcomes but also moral and religious awareness. In line with the implementation of the Merdeka Curriculum, assessment rubrics can also integrate the dimensions of the Profil Pelajar Pancasila, using religiosity, integrity, and cooperation as key criteria in attitude assessment. Rubrics enable authentic evaluation of students' religious practices in daily life for instance, through observing prayer behavior, social participation, and environmental care thus making PAI rubrics not merely administrative tools but instruments of continuous character formation (Anon., 2021).

Moreover, rubrics serve as reflective tools for teachers. When a majority of students fail to meet certain indicators, teachers can reevaluate teaching methods, media, or strategies. This process fosters a constructive evaluative cycle between teacher and student. Hence, rubrics function not only as measurement instruments but also as learning tools that encourage pedagogical improvement based on formative and summative evaluation principles. Integrating formative and summative assessment through rubrics allows teachers to monitor learning progress over time, especially in aspects of faith development, worship consistency, and honesty in social interactions (Tini Melinda, 2025).

From a professional standpoint, PAI teachers require intensive training in effective rubric design and implementation. Studies show that misunderstandings of rubric concepts often lead to subjective assessment. Practice-based training helps teachers produce specific and measurable descriptors and avoid personal bias. Therefore, assessment literacy becomes a key indicator of professional and ethical Islamic educators (Fitri, 2023).

Digital transformation in education also provides great opportunities for rubric innovation. Platforms such as Google Classroom, Microsoft Forms, and the Madrasah Learning Management System (LMS) allow teachers to apply electronic rubrics (e-rubrics). These tools facilitate automatic scoring, transparent documentation, and real-time feedback. Through e-rubrics, students can immediately understand their performance levels and identify areas for improvement. Rubrics also play a strategic role in character-based Islamic learning by operationalizing indicators such as honesty, responsibility, patience, and tolerance values observable in students' daily behavior (Anon., 2025c).

Nonetheless, challenges persist. Teachers often face time constraints, inconsistent interpretation among assessors, and administrative overload. To address these issues, schools can form assessment teams to co-develop rubrics, calibrate scores, and revise

indicators collaboratively. Such collaboration ensures consistency and credibility in assessment results (Imanudin, 2023).

Beyond technical aspects, ethical dimensions of assessment must not be overlooked. Objectivity involves not only clear criteria but also integrity and sincerity on the part of the teacher. From an Islamic perspective, assessment is an act of trust (*amanah*) that must be conducted with justice (*'adl*). Teachers who internalize fairness will assess not based on personal closeness but on actual student achievement. Spiritual values such as sincerity (*ikhlas*) and honesty (*sidq*) form the moral foundation of objective and transparent evaluation (Anon., 2020b).

Future innovations in PAI rubric development may include the use of AI-based rubric systems capable of detecting student performance patterns automatically, offering instructional recommendations, and minimizing human bias. Adaptive rubrics could further personalize learning by aligning assessment indicators with students' abilities and learning styles. Such innovations reinforce the personalized learning paradigm central to 21st-century education (Mahmudi, 2023).

Nevertheless, rubric development must remain grounded in Islamic ethical values. Justice, trustworthiness, and excellence (*ihsan*) should guide every assessment practice. Fair evaluation fosters student trust, while transparency promotes intrinsic motivation to improve. Hence, rubric design should not merely replicate secular models but should be contextualized within Islamic educational principles (Pajrin, 2021)

Ultimately, the success of rubric implementation depends on the school's academic culture. Schools that value openness, reflection, and collaboration can more easily establish transparent assessment systems. Conversely, schools focused solely on test results may struggle to adopt rubrics as their primary evaluative tools. Therefore, school leaders and educational supervisors must provide policy support and academic supervision to ensure rubrics become an integral part of constructive evaluation culture.

Rubrics also enhance students' assessment literacy. Exposure to explicit criteria and indicators helps learners recognize quality standards in their work, fostering metacognitive awareness and reflective thinking two essential skills in 21st-century learning. When students understand how they are evaluated, transparency nurtures intrinsic motivation for self-improvement rather than grade-oriented learning (Dwistia, 2022)

In addition to serving as evaluation tools, rubrics have potential as classroom action research instruments. Teachers can use rubrics to identify learning problems, implement interventions, and measure the impact of pedagogical changes. Thus, rubrics are not merely administrative tools but empirical instruments for continuous improvement (Anon., 2025b).

In conclusion, the development of objective and transparent PAI assessment rubrics represents a transformative step toward a more just, reflective, and contextual Islamic education. A well-designed rubric functions not only as a measurement tool but also as a mirror reflecting the quality of the teacher–student relationship in the learning process. When thoughtfully constructed, rubrics can serve as transformative instruments that nurture balanced growth in faith, knowledge, and moral character. In the future, the synergy between digital innovation, teacher professionalism, and Islamic spiritual values will form the foundation of a dignified and equitable assessment system (Shodiq, 2025).

#### 4. Conclusion

Based on the above discussion, it can be concluded that the development of assessment rubrics in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning is a strategic step toward creating a more objective, transparent, and character-oriented evaluation system rooted in Islamic values. Analytically designed rubrics enable a detailed mapping of cognitive, affective, and psychomotor dimensions, thereby reducing assessor subjectivity and improving the validity of assessment results. In the context of PAI learning, rubrics not only evaluate religious knowledge but also observe students' attitudes, worship practices, and the application of Islamic values in real-life situations. The clarity of descriptors at each achievement level helps teachers align their assessment perceptions and ensures inter-rater reliability. Transparency of the rubric to students has been shown to enhance learning motivation, accountability, and academic honesty. When students understand the standards used in assessment, they have a clear direction for self-improvement and strive to reach their highest potential. In this sense, the rubric serves a dual function: both as an evaluation tool and as a medium for reflective learning.

Teacher involvement in rubric development is key to successful implementation, as teachers best understand students' contexts and learning environments. Collaborative processes between teachers, assessment experts, and policymakers ensure that rubric indicators align with core curriculum competencies and avoid personal or cultural bias. Furthermore, the combination of analytic and holistic rubrics has proven effective in PAI assessment. Analytic rubrics are more suitable for evaluating practical skills such as ablution, prayer, and Qur'an recitation, as they provide specific feedback for each component, while holistic rubrics are more efficient for assessing general attitudes and behaviors. Using both types proportionally produces a comprehensive and efficient assessment.

On the other hand, rubric development also requires continuous training for PAI teachers to enable them to design communicative, measurable indicators aligned with learning objectives. Periodic inter-teacher scoring calibration must be conducted to maintain consistency and fairness in evaluation results. The integration of digital technology offers significant opportunities to improve accountability and efficiency in assessment. The use of e-rubrics, digital portfolios, or video evidence of worship practices facilitates documentation, enables internal audits, and provides reflective opportunities for both teachers and students. Technology also opens possibilities for AI-based assessment systems that can analyze students' achievement patterns and provide automated feedback. However, the development of digital rubrics must remain grounded in Islamic educational (*tarbawi*) values to preserve the spiritual essence of the learning process.

The cultural context and diversity of students in Indonesia must also be major considerations in designing PAI assessment rubrics. Assessment indicators should be inclusive, free from cultural bias, and reflect universal Islamic values such as honesty, trustworthiness, and justice. Culturally sensitive rubrics will be more relevant and better accepted by diverse student groups. Thus, assessment rubrics should not merely serve as administrative instruments but as educational tools that instill noble Islamic character (*akhlaqul karimah*) in daily life.

Ultimately, the success of implementing PAI assessment rubrics depends on three main factors: the quality of the instrument, teacher competence, and institutional support.

Schools must establish policies governing the design, validation, and periodic evaluation of rubrics to ensure their alignment with curriculum dynamics and students' learning needs. The implementation of objective and transparent rubrics has been proven to increase assessment validity and reliability, strengthen students' character, and foster a culture of honest, reflective, and fair learning. With the synergy of digital innovation, teacher professionalism, and Islamic spiritual values, the development of PAI assessment rubrics will become the foundation for realizing a dignified, adaptive, and holistic Islamic education system oriented toward forming insan kamil the ideal human being.

## 5. Bibliography

- Anon. (2020a). Kesulitan Guru Dalam Melakukan Evaluasi Pembelajaran PAI. *Al-Afkar Journal*. [https://mail-alafkar.com/index.php/Afkar\\_Journal/article/download/1461/1273/15338](https://mail-alafkar.com/index.php/Afkar_Journal/article/download/1461/1273/15338)
- Anon. (2020b). Penggunaan Performance Assessment Sebagai Instrumen PAI. *Jurnal UPY PKN*. <https://journal.upy.ac.id/index.php/pkn/article/download/6538/4080/21849>
- Anon. (2021). Penilaian Autentik pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Fondatia*. <https://ejournal.stitpn.ac.id/index.php/fondatia/article/download/301/290/>
- Anon. (2022). Rubrik Penilaian Pembelajaran PAI (makalah). *Stainida Eladabi*. [https://mynida.stainidaeladabi.ac.id/asset/file\\_tugas/b4809-makalah-evaluasi-kel8-sudah.pdf](https://mynida.stainidaeladabi.ac.id/asset/file_tugas/b4809-makalah-evaluasi-kel8-sudah.pdf)
- Anon. (2023). Assessment as, for, of learning pembelajaran pendidikan agama. *Humanika (UNY)*. <https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/humanika/article/view/61406>
- Anon. (2024). Pengembangan Instrumen Penilaian Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Al-Rabwah*. <https://jurnal.staiskutim.ac.id/index.php/al-rabwah/article/download/433/236/2313>
- Anon. (2025a). Analisis Instrumen Assessment Pembelajaran PAI Berbasis Multikultural. *Jurnal P4I*. <https://jurnalp4i.com/index.php/learning/article/download/6653/4607/50621>
- Anon. (2025b). Analisis Proses Pembelajaran PAI. *Jurnal Didaktika*. <https://jurnaldidaktika.org/contents/article/download/2274/1089/>
- Anon. (2025c). Konsep Dasar Evaluasi Dan Implikasinya Dalam Evaluasi PAI. *Jurnal MPI Aripafi*. <https://journal.aripafi.or.id/index.php/jmpai/article/download/1300/1581/6678>
- Dwistia, H. (2022). Karakteristik Instrumen Penilaian Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal PIB*. <https://ojs.stai-ibnurusyd.ac.id/index.php/jpib/article/view/94>
- Fitri, F. (2023). The Effectiveness of Peer Assessment in Assessing Students' Spiritual Attitudes in Islamic Religious Education Learning in Middle Schools. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Indonesia (JPAIL)*, 4(4), 95–98. <https://doi.org/10.37251/jpaii.v4i4.784>
- Imanudin, B. A. (2023). Penilaian Autentik terhadap Pembelajaran PAI. *Raudhah*. <https://ejournal.stairu.ac.id/index.php/raudhah/article/download/310/201>

- Latifah, E. N., Malihah, N., & Irwansyah, F. S. (2025). *Assessment of Pedagogical Competence of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) Teachers: A Literature Review*. <https://ejournal.bumipublikasinusantara.id/index.php/ajores>
- Mahmudi, I. (2023). Mengembangkan Rubrik Penilaian Praktis yang Efektif. *IJHSS (UIT-Lirboyo)*. <https://ejournal.uit-lirboyo.ac.id/index.php/IJHSS/article/view/4421>
- Muinudin, W. (2022). Kisi-Kisi Instrumen Pembelajaran PAI. *JPAI (Uniga)*. <https://journal.uniga.ac.id/index.php/JPAI/article/download/42282/2442/14541>
- Nursyamsiyah, S. (2023). Evaluation Model of Islamic Education Learning in Schools in The Digital Age. *International Journal of Social Learning (IJSL)*, 3(2), 188–201. <https://doi.org/10.47134/ijsl.v3i2.128>
- Pajrin, N. A. S. (2021). Studi Prosedur Penilaian Domain Afektif oleh Guru PAI di SMP. *Tarbawy (UPI)*. <https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/tarbawy/article/download/19695/10639>
- Shodiq, A. (2025). Pengembangan Instrumen dan Rubrik Penilaian Untuk Madrasah. *JER*. <https://mail.jer.or.id/index.php/jer/article/view/2299>
- Silvia, E. (2024). Pembelajaran PAI; Penilaian Kinerja (Performance). *Jurnal Pendidikan EP (Undiksha)*. [https://ejournal2.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/jurnal\\_ep/article/view/3974](https://ejournal2.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/jurnal_ep/article/view/3974)
- Tini Melinda. (2025). Penerapan Penilaian Autentik dalam PAI. *YASIN: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Sosial Budaya*. <https://ejournal.yasin-alsys.org/yasin/article/download/5953/4608>
- Umami, M. (2018). Penilaian Autentik Pembelajaran PAI dan Budi Pekerti dalam Kurikulum 2013. *Jurnal Kependidikan (UIN)*. <https://ejournal.uinsaizu.ac.id/index.php/jurnalkependidikan/article/view/2259>