

LEGAL PROTECTION FOR COPYRIGHT HOLDERS AGAINST ILLEGAL DISTRIBUTION OF FILMS THROUGH STREAMING SITES

Lira Nova Eliza, Ismail Koto

Email: liranovaeliza0@gmail.com

Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Utara

ABSTRACT

This study analyzes the legal protection for copyright holders for the illegal distribution of films through streaming sites from a civil law perspective in Indonesia. The development of information technology and increased internet access have encouraged the widespread distribution of films without permission from copyright holders, which results in economic losses and violations of moral rights as regulated in Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright. This practice not only impacts creators and broadcasting rights license holders but also has implications for the sustainability of the national film industry, which is protected by Law Number 33 of 2009 concerning Film. This problem demands legal certainty regarding the status of copyright as a property right and a form of legal accountability for violations that occur in the digital space. This study uses a normative legal research method with a statutory and conceptual approach. Data were obtained through a literature study of primary legal materials in the form of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright, Law Number 33 of 2009 concerning Film, and the Civil Code, and supported by secondary legal materials in the form of books, journals, and the doctrines of legal experts. The analysis was conducted qualitatively by examining the principles, norms, and legal concepts relevant to the practice of illegal film distribution in the digital era. The results of the study indicate that copyright on film works is an intangible object included in the category of property rights and provides exclusive rights to the creator or copyright holder. The illegal distribution of films through streaming sites fulfills the elements of an unlawful act as regulated in Article 1365 of the Civil Code because it violates the economic rights and moral rights of the creator. Copyright holders have the right to file a civil lawsuit in the form of material and immaterial compensation, termination of unlawful acts, confiscation of the proceeds of violation, and restoration of moral rights through the Commercial Court mechanism. Thus, civil legal protection has a strategic

role in ensuring legal certainty, creating justice for copyright holders, and providing a deterrent effect on perpetrators of copyright infringement in the digital realm.

Keywords: Copyright, Films, Illegal Streaming Sites, Property Rights, Unlawful Acts, Civil Legal Protection.

A. Introduction

Intellectual property plays a role in providing legal protection for the ownership of intellectual works, both communal and personal, which is the foundation for the development of the creative economy. Therefore, intellectual property protection is a crucial part of future national development and contributes significantly to national and international economic development. (Ismail Koto, 2023).

Intellectual property rights (IPR) are rights derived from human thought and produce products or processes that benefit human life. Indonesia has a variety of intellectual property rights. As a country that ratified the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), Indonesia has a fundamental legal framework for these types of intellectual property rights. Each intellectual property right is governed by its own laws.

According to Sudikno Mertokusumo, Intellectual Property Rights are rights to tangible property, including the products of human thought, such as works and inventions. Science and technology have made it seem as if nations around the world have no national borders. People in other parts of the world can easily access various developments within a country, which are rapidly spreading. This situation is directly correlated with the growth of Intellectual Property Rights (IPR). (Ismail Koto, 2023).

Along with the development of the times, human life today is very dependent on gadgets. The internet has a lot of influence in the current era of globalization, especially regarding copyright. The definition of copyright is contained in Article 1 paragraph (1) of Law no. 28 of 2014 which reads: "Copyright is the exclusive right of the creator that arises automatically based on the declarative principle, after a creation is realized in a tangible form without reducing restrictions in accordance with statutory regulations." The copyright holder is the creator as the owner of the copyright, the party who legally receives the right from the creator. As in Article 9 paragraph (1) of the Copyright Law which states that anyone who utilizes the economic rights of that person may not reproduce or use the creation before there

is or obtains permission from the creator Legal Protection of Copyright Holders Against Free Movie Sites on the Internet. (Annisa Rachmasari, 2022).

According to Copyright Law No. 28 of 2014, distributing a film without permission from the copyright holder is a violation subject to legal sanctions. Copyright holders have the exclusive right to reproduce, distribute, and trade their works, including films. This means that without permission from the copyright holder, distributing the film on the Idlix platform is unlawful. (Inka Dwi Octavia, 2024).

In cases of unauthorized distribution of a film on the Idlix platform, the copyright holder can file a lawsuit against the platform and the parties responsible for the distribution. The lawsuit can result in compensation and criminal sanctions under the Copyright Law.

According to the Ministry of Communication and Information, in December 2019, efforts to curb content piracy, including films, by blocking a total of 1,745 illegal movie streaming sites, and even blocking content including illegal films, were insufficient. Creators are also guaranteed to receive no royalties from the use of their works because their names are not credited on these sites.

In granting exclusive rights to creators, there are two fundamental rights: moral rights and economic rights. Moral rights are inherent in the creator and cannot be transferred, while economic rights are the creator's right to receive economic benefits from their work. These moral rights allow the creator to prohibit others from altering or reducing their work without their permission. (Zaenal Arifin, 2022).

Although the Copyright Law regulates the protection of film works and the government has blocked illegal streaming sites, in practice, unauthorized distribution of films continues to occur and causes losses to copyright holders. This indicates that legal protection for film copyright holders, particularly from a civil law perspective, has not been optimal. Therefore, further study is needed regarding legal protection for copyright holders against the illegal distribution of films through streaming sites. This situation indicates a gap between applicable legal norms and actual practice, particularly in the enforcement of civil law against perpetrators of violations.

Therefore, the issue of legal protection for copyright holders regarding the illegal distribution of films is an important and relevant issue that needs to be studied more deeply, in order to find an effective legal solution and provide certainty and justice for creators in facing the dynamics of the digital era.

B. Research Methods

A study cannot be called research if it does not have a research method.¹ Research methods are one of the factors of a problem that will be discussed. The study was conducted using secondary data which was analyzed qualitatively using the Desk Research Method. The literature materials used in writing this research are several references originating from research results, studies, and reviews of several writings which are then summarized into a scientific paper.²

C. Discussion

1. The Position of Copyright on Film Works as Property Rights According to Civil Law in Indonesia

According to the 2002 Copyright Law, in accordance with the concept of the Berne Convention and supplemented by the 2014 Copyright Law, creative work is any work that shows originality in the field of science, art, or literature. The criteria for expertise in this field include the creation of books, computer programs, promotional materials, presentations, and the design of published works and all other written works, as well as the creation of interviews, conferences, speeches, and other similar works. The remainder is material for educational and scientific purposes. (Al Munif Hanafi, 2023).

Creative works in the arts include music with or without lyrics, theater and drama, dance, choreography, wayang, and pantomime. It also encompasses all forms of fine art, such as painting, calligraphy, carving, collage, and applied art. The remainder includes architectural works, maps, batik art, photography, and film.

Copyright is the exclusive right of the creator which arises automatically based on the declarative principle after a creation is realized in a tangible form without reducing restrictions in accordance with the provisions of statutory regulations, in accordance with Article 1 paragraph (1) of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright. Copyright as referred to in the Law consists of moral rights and economic rights.

Copyright is an exclusive right consisting of moral rights (moral rights) and economic rights (economic rights). Moral rights are inherent eternally to the creator, while economic

¹ Hanifah, I., Hariyanto, H., Ginting, L., Koto, I., & Syafriana, R. (2026). Legal Protection of Indonesia's Fisheries from Foreign Investment: A Social-State Approach. *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan*, 14(1).

² Simatupang, R. S. A., Hanifah, I., & Mansar, A. (2025). The Concept of Restitution as Legal Accountability in the Crime of Human Trafficking. *Pena Justisia: Media Komunikasi dan Kajian Hukum*, 24(1), 3554-3462.

rights are the creator's or copyright holder's right to obtain economic benefits from the creation. Exclusive rights mean that these rights are reserved solely for the creator, so no other party may exploit them without the creator's permission. Moral rights and economic rights require absolute legal protection. (Fatimah Nurul Aini, 2021).

Moral Rights are rights that are eternally attached to the creator, cannot be separated from the creator because they are personal and eternal, meaning that these rights are attached during the creator's life and even after his death. Moral Rights are attached to the creator to continue to include or not include his name on copies in connection with the use of his creation for the public, using his alias or pseudonym, changing his creation, or things that are detrimental to his honor or reputation. In the protection of Moral Rights, the creator can have Copyright management information or electronic Copyright information. Copyright management information includes information on methods or systems that can identify the originality of the substance of the creation and its creator as well as information codes and access codes. (Ayup Suran Ningsih, 2019).

Economic rights are the exclusive rights of the Creator or Copyright Holder to obtain economic benefits from the creation. Trade place managers are prohibited from allowing the sale or duplication of goods resulting from infringement of Copyright and Related Rights in the trade places they manage. Economic rights are limited to a creation if the creation remains in the hands of the Creator or Copyright Holder, so that economic rights cannot be transferred to the recipient of the transfer of rights to the creation. A creation is said to have been born or materialized if the creation can be seen with the naked eye or can be heard. From that moment, the creator or copyright holder has exclusive rights to his creation without the need for formal registration of rights.

The word "cinematography" comes from the Latin word "kinema," meaning picture. In general, cinematography encompasses everything related to film, including aesthetics, form, function, meaning, production, process, and audience quality. In this context, cinematography encompasses a complex understanding of art, photography, technology, visual communication, the film industry, ideas, ideals, and imagination. (Sebastian A. Lendeng, 2021)

Cinematographic works are protected by Copyright as tangible objects. Cinematographic works have a protection period of 50 years from the first publication. Films as the embodiment of cinematographic works are also objects of Copyright protection. In cinematographic works, the creator of the work is the director, while the story writer as the

creator of the work is part of the film's writing. Copyright holders of cinematographic works include actors or actresses and film crew. The entire series of film making is related to the object of Copyright, including film soundtracks, graphic design, film exhibitions, and film advertisements. Cinematographic works are part of the object of Copyright protection, as stated in Article 40 letter m of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright. Internationally, the protection granted to cinematographic works is stated in the Berne Convention which states that literary and artistic expressions are protected, which also includes cinematographic works.

Digital works are incredibly easy to duplicate, and the results are virtually indistinguishable from the original. People can then modify the copies and distribute them worldwide at virtually no cost. While this makes it incredibly easy for anyone to infringe on the copyright of others on a massive scale, it is also incredibly difficult for copyright owners to detect, recognize, or take legal action. As a work of art, a film is considered intellectual property and belongs to the creator.

Based on Article 1 paragraph 1 of Law Number 33 of 2009 concerning Film, film is a creative work of art and culture which is a social institution and mass communication media. Based on the rules of morality and performance, as well as the lack of understanding of works of art and works of art protected by law, the filmmaker has exclusive rights, namely the right to monopolize his work in order to protect his work from other parties. These rights include announcing, reproducing works of creation, or granting permission to others to obtain economic benefits in accordance with their rights, namely economic rights.

According to Article 1 number 1 of Law Number 33 of 2009 concerning Film, Film is a work of cultural art which is a social institution and media.

mass communication created based on cinematographic rules with or without sound and can be shown. Discussing films, it cannot be separated from regulations regarding a creation.

Copyright is one of the various rights described in Article 499 of the Civil Code. This categorizes intangible property rights as property rights and can be the object of property rights. Property rights are absolute rights to ownership of an item, but there are absolute rights whose object is property. This property right explains that as wealth increases, consumption also increases, although not entirely proportionally.

Objects can be either tangible or intangible. This definition means that objects are tangible objects or material goods that have a form because they can be seen and touched, or in other words, tangible goods. (Muhammad Yusuf Ibrahim, 2023)

The concept of copyright as a property right aligns with the concept of Indonesian civil law, which is implicitly contained in the property law system, which refers to the provisions of Article 499 of the Civil Code, which states that what is referred to as a property is both goods and rights. Goods are defined as tangible objects (material objects), while rights are defined as intangible or immaterial objects.

According to Article 503 and Article 504 of the Civil Code, objects are divided into tangible objects (*lichamelijke zaken*) and intangible objects (*onlichamelijke zaken*) and objects immovable (*on-roende zaken*). Tangible objects are objects that can be seen

by the eye and touched by hand, on the other hand, intangible objects are objects in the form of rights or bills. In accordance with the definition of intangible objects above, it is appropriate if copyright is categorized as an intangible object as stated in Article 16 paragraph (1) of Law No. 28 of 2014, that copyright is an intangible movable object, this is because copyright contains a collection of rights. (Rachmadi Usman. 2021)

The copyright transfer and licensing system is directly related to the nature of copyright as a *sui generis* property right. The copyright transfer system cannot fully utilize the Civil Code system regarding the transfer of ownership rights. The Civil Code itself regulates the procedures for acquiring ownership rights in Articles 584 to 624 of the Civil Code. Of all these articles, it can be said that not a single article can be applied in the process of acquiring copyright, except perhaps for inheritance and wills. Meanwhile, the transfer of rights, as the implementation of a sale and purchase agreement, for example, as regulated in Article 613 of the Civil Code, is also difficult or even impossible to apply in the context of the transfer of copyright. (Agus, 2022)

Copyright as an intangible movable object can also be transferred. This transfer is carried out through the transfer of two rights that arise from a copyright, namely moral rights and economic rights. Article 5 paragraph (2) of the Copyright Law states that moral rights can be transferred by will after the creator dies. Meanwhile, in the transfer of economic rights, copyright can be transferred on the basis of: inheritance, gift, endowment, written agreement, or other reasons permitted by law (Article 16 paragraph (2) of the Copyright Law).

2. Legal Liability of Parties Violating the Rights of Film Broadcasting License Holders in Indonesia

One of the goals of legislation is legal certainty, as its regulations or legal norms are easily implemented and adapted. Under the Copyright Act, the use of a film must be based on permission from the creator or copyright holder to fulfill their exclusive rights. Granting permission from the creator or copyright holder to another party is called a license. Thus, cinematographic works as objects of copyright may only be used by others after obtaining permission from the creator or copyright holder. However, distribution of films is carried out by application users. (Kairuddin, 2023)

In practice, the proliferation of illegal streaming sites and unauthorized film screenings in public spaces demonstrates a lack of legal awareness regarding the importance of copyright protection. Many businesses view film screenings as trivial, even though legally, such actions constitute a violation of the license holder's exclusive rights.

On the other hand, the film's success among the public is exploited by irresponsible parties who quickly re-release the films on the internet for profit. They stream or download films online, and upload them to free movie hosting sites. In this way, they profit from the film's success without permission and without paying royalties to the film's producers or copyright holders.

The act of distributing films for free, then makes film producers suffer losses, because they have to pay royalties to film studios or creators of cinematographic works, on the other hand the income that is expected to be obtained is not realized, so this makes the film industry or creators of cinematographic works reluctant to work/produce films again, which results in a decrease in investment.

Film works on illegal streaming sites are cinematographic works that are protected by copyright. According to Article 40 paragraph (1) letter m of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright, it is stated that: "Protected creations include creations in the fields of science, art, and literature, one of which is cinematographic works." As stated in the explanation of Article 40 paragraph (1) letter m of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright. what is meant by "cinematographic works" are creations in the form of moving images (moving images), including documentary films, advertising films, reportage or story films made with scenarios, and cartoon films.

Cinematographic works can be made on celluloid tape, videotape, video disc, optical disc, and/or other media that can be shown in cinemas, on the big screen, on television, or other media. Cinematography is one example of an audiovisual form. Its functions and responsibilities are in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations.

Illegal streaming conducted intentionally without permission. Reproducing a broadcast copyrighted work in any way without obtaining permission from the broadcast rights license holder for commercial purposes can be considered copyright infringement. This act is carried out by illegal streaming operators who copy or duplicate the broadcast work, and therefore can be considered a form of copyright infringement.

This activity causes economic losses for filmmakers, distributors, and other parties involved in the creative industry. IndoXXI's actions include several violations, including illegal reproduction by re-uploading films without official permission, illegal distribution, and the distribution of pirated content via the internet, as well as commercial exploitation for financial gain through advertising.

Liability arising from unlawful acts, particularly those of film distributors, is stipulated by law for copyright owners or holders. If the owner or holder is dissatisfied, they can sue the infringer under the rules and regulations. (Merlin, 2023)

Liability in civil law is an unlawful act, an illegal act, and a breach of obligation, an act of not fulfilling an obligation. A promise (default). Liability for unlawful acts is regulated in Article 1365 of the Civil Code, where for every criminal act that causes losses suffered by another person, the person who caused the loss must be borne by the person who caused the loss by replacing it.

The term "unlawful act" is called "onrechtmatige daad" in Dutch. In fact, "onrechtmatige daad" isn't the only word that can be interpreted as an unlawful act; there are other terms, such as "Unlawful Act," "Civil Misappropriation," "Unlawful Act," "Act contrary to law," and "Act contrary to legal principles."

In addition, the responsibility of digital platforms can also be reviewed based on Law Number 11 of 2008 concerning Electronic Information and Transactions as amended by Law Number 19 of 2016. The ITE Law provides a legal basis for electronic system managers to be responsible for the implementation of the systems they manage. In the context of the distribution of illegal films, streaming platforms as electronic system organizers have an

obligation to ensure that the content provided or broadcast through their systems does not violate the law, including

Violating copyright. If a platform knows or should have known about illegal film content but fails to take action to remove or prevent it, it may be held legally liable.

3. Legal Protection for Copyright Holders Harmed by Illegal Film Distribution

Law No. 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright is a law that regulates copyright. provides control and punishment to people who commit piracy of someone's work. This law provides fair and firm protection because more and more people are not protected. Understand the contents of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright, especially regarding creative works. cinematography which includes films. The film is protected by the state and automatically has the right to control the work since the work was created in a tangible form. The legal consequences that will be received if there is a violation of film copyright as regulated in. Article 99 of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright in civil, namely: Creator. The Copyright Owner has the right to file a lawsuit requesting. Compensation to the Commercial Court for violating Copyright. (Agung, 2022)

Copyright protection covers the fields of science, art, and. Literature is one form of art protected by copyright, namely works. cinematography. This is regulated in Article 40 paragraph (1) letter m of the Law on Human Rights. is clearly stated. Cinematography is a work or creation in the form of moving images, such as documentaries or advertising films. cartoons or other films that have been made based on stories in certain scenarios. (Sinta 2023)

A claim for damages as referred to may include a request for the surrender of all or part of the income obtained as a result of Copyright infringement. In addition, the Creator, Copyright Holder, or Related Rights Owner may also file a request for an interim or provisional injunction with the commercial court to: request the confiscation of works created, prohibited or duplicated, as well as the reproduction tools used to create works resulting from acts of Copyright infringement and related rights products; or to stop the activity of announcing, distributing, communicating, or duplicating works originating from acts of Copyright infringement.

Parties who suffer losses due to unlawful actions. These include: Creators, whose royalties should be received through the rights holder. Copyright does not actually benefit the creator. In fact, their work is enjoyed by other individuals. Royalties are also an amount paid for the use of property, for example, for not obtaining patents, copyrights, or natural resources.

Payments are made properly in accordance with what they should receive and their actions. This condition can also lead to apathy and reduce performance.

A strong passion for creativity enhances the process of creating works in the fields of science, literature, and the arts, particularly in filmmaking. Works created must be valued by the public through purchase. These works are screened directly at the film's location, namely in cinemas. However, many individuals alter works and distribute them to illegal sites for free.

Applicable laws are often violated in various ways in various fields, both civil and criminal, especially in today's era of globalization, where laws must be able to adapt to the progress of the times. The world of film is included in the intellectual property in the film industry, where Intellectual Property can be interpreted as a special right owned by the creator or actor, innovation, or designer of creative works that have commercial value, by registering them with certain institutions as a form of respect and recognition of rights that deserve to be protected by the state today. Current technological developments also have a negative impact on something. creative works, one of which is in the world of the film industry, to the point that negative actions arise, such as the distribution of full video films. (Firda, 2024)

In the Copyright Law, copyright is explained as an exclusive right contained in Article 1. This exclusive right is the right to reproduce a work or grant permission to others to do the same, but within the limits of applicable law. Cinematographic works or films are protected in the Copyright Law, especially in Article 40 paragraph (1) letter m. This article states that cinematographic works are works in the form of moving images, such as documentary films, advertising films, reportage, or story films that use scenarios, as well as cartoon films.

Cinematographic works can be made in various forms such as celluloid tape, video tape, video disc, optical disc, or other media that can be shown in cinemas, big screens, television, or other media. Cinematographic works or films are protected for 50 years after the announcement in the Copyright Law Article 59 paragraph (1). So, if we do not transfer economic rights for 50 years, we still have those rights.

Copyright infringement has two main aspects. First, intentionally copying or authorizing unauthorized use of a work. Second, intentionally displaying, distributing, or selling to the public an item that results from copyright infringement. (Aderista, 2020) One of the most common copyright violations is by How to download and watch movies on websites on the internet. There are more and more movie sites

Free online streaming has led to a shift in public habits from watching films in theaters to watching them on websites. This, of course, is detrimental to creators and copyright holders, as these websites reproduce films without their permission. Several illegal websites are still active, including IndoXXI, LK21, Bioskop Keren, Nonton Movie, Gudang Movie 21, and Bioskop 21. It's clear that the website owners are the ones committing cinematographic copyright infringement.

Legal protection means providing a sense of security and comfort and guaranteeing the human rights of those who have been harmed, with the hope that they will fully enjoy their legally protected rights.

One form of firm civil legal protection is the creator's right to file a civil lawsuit. Article 99 of Law Number 28 of 2014 concerning Copyright grants creators or copyright holders the right to seek compensation from any party who violates their economic rights. This lawsuit is filed with the Commercial Court as a legal remedy to recover the losses incurred.

D. Conclusion

The status of copyright over film works as a property right under Indonesian civil law is an exclusive right inherent in the creator or copyright holder, both in the form of moral rights and economic rights. Film copyright is qualified as an intangible object that can be controlled, transferred, and protected by law. As a property right, copyright gives its holder full authority to regulate the use of the film, including prohibiting others from duplicating, broadcasting, or distributing it without permission.

Legal accountability for copyright holders for the illegal distribution of films is achieved through preventive and repressive protection. Preventive protection is realized through the establishment of legislation, copyright awareness campaigns, and the government's blocking of illegal streaming sites. Meanwhile, repressive protection is achieved through civil lawsuits and criminal law enforcement against copyright infringement. However, the widespread distribution of illegal films demonstrates that this legal protection is ineffective, necessitating stronger synergy between the government, law enforcement officials, and the public.

Law enforcement in protecting copyright against the illegal distribution of films is carried out through preventive and repressive efforts. Preventive protection includes the establishment of legislation, socialization of copyright law, and government action in the form of blocking illegal streaming sites by the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology. Repressive protection is carried out through civil law enforcement with demands for

compensation and criminal law enforcement against perpetrators of copyright infringement. However, the continued high practice of illegal film distribution indicates that legal protection is not yet effective, so stronger synergy is needed between the government, law enforcement officials, and the public in maintaining and protecting film copyright in Indonesia.

Bibliography

- Abbas Abdullah, Kevin Aprio Putra Sugianta, Khaerul Anwar, (2021), "The Position of Copyright as a Property Right and the Execution of Fiduciary Guarantees for Copyright", *Journal of Legal, Social and Political Science Research*, Volume 1 number 13
- Affila, et.al, (2025), "Legal Responsibility for Royalty Payment Obligations in the Mie Gacoan Case in Bali", *Jurnal Deli*, Volume 1 number 1
- Edward James Sinaga, (2020), *Royalty Management for Announcements of Song and/or Musical Works*, *Scientific Journal of Public Policy*, Volume 14 number 3
- Firmandanu Triatmojo, Achmad Irwan Hamzani, and Kanti Rahayu (2021), *Copyright Protection of Commercial Songs*, Central Java: NEM
- Habi Kusno, (2016), "Legal Protection of Copyright for Creators of Songs Downloaded via the Internet", Volume 10 number 3, *Justisia Journal*
- Hanifah, I., Hariyanto, H., Ginting, L., Koto, I., & Syafriana, R. (2026). Legal Protection of Indonesia's Fisheries from Foreign Investment: A Social-State Approach. *Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan*, 14(1).
- Marulam Hutaaruk, (2022), *Licenses & Royalties for Songs/Music in Public Places*, Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia
- NKS Dharmawan, (2017), *Copyright Provisions Relating to Royalty Payments for Commercial Use of Song Creations in Restaurants/Cafes in the Jimbaran Bali Tourism Area*, *Udayana Mengabdi Bulletin Journal*, Volume 16 number 1
- Simatupang, R. S. A., Hanifah, I., & Mansar, A. (2025). The Concept of Restitution as Legal Accountability in the Crime of Human Trafficking. *Pena Justisia: Media Komunikasi dan Kajian Hukum*, 24(1), 3554-3462.