

OPTIMIZATION OF THE ROLE OF LEGISLATION DESIGNERS IN IMPLEMENTING HARMONIZATION OF REGIONAL REGULATION DRAFT

Fauzi Iswahyudi¹, Faisal Akbar Nasution², Suhaidi³

¹ Master of Law Program, Faculty of Law, Universitas Sumatera Utara

^{2,3} Faculty of Law, Universitas Sumatera Utara

Email : fauziiswahyudi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Harmonization of regional regulations as an effort to ensure alignment between draft regional regulations and higher regulations. The role of the drafter of legislation is very important in this process, considering the complexity of regulations and the need for an integrated legal system. This research aims to analyze the optimization of the role of legislative regulation designers in carrying out harmonization of draft regional regulations. This research uses normative legal research with a statutory approach.. The results of the study indicate that drafters have a strategic responsibility in ensuring the consistency of legislation, both vertically and horizontally. However, a number of challenges were identified, such as lack of coordination between stakeholders, limited technical capacity, and political uncertainty that affects the independence of drafters. Effective harmonization of regional regulations requires the role of drafters who are not only legal technicians, but also facilitators in building legal integration that is responsive to the dynamics of society and the needs of regional development. This optimization is important to create regional regulations that are quality, fair, and do not conflict with higher regulations.

Keywords: *Harmonization; Designer; Regulation; Region.*

Journal History

Received	: November 19, 2024;
Reviewed	: November 23, 2024;
Accepted	: November 29, 2024;
Published	: November 30, 2024.

Copyright @2022 NLR. All right reserved.

INTRODUCTION

Essentially, in the implementation of decentralization there are 2 (two) important elements that are interrelated, namely the formation of autonomous regions and the legal transfer of power from the central government to regional governments to regulate and handle certain government affairs that are handed over. In order to regulate and manage government affairs themselves according to the principles of autonomy

and assistance duties, Regional Governments are given the right to establish regional regulations and other regional legal products.¹

Regional regulations as an important legal instrument in the implementation of regional autonomy, function as a legal basis for regional governments in exercising their authority. However, in the process of drafting Regional Regulations, problems are often found in the form of inconsistencies with higher laws and regulations, inconsistencies between articles, and overlaps with other regulations.

Harmonization aims to create harmony and integration in the legal regulation system, both vertically and horizontally. In this context, the role of the designer of the legal regulation becomes very crucial. The designer is not only responsible for the technical aspects of the preparation, but also in ensuring that the substance of the Regional Regulation is in accordance with applicable legal norms and is responsive to the needs of the community. However, optimizing the role of the designer often faces various challenges so that quality, effective, and useful regulations can be produced.

The increasingly developing and dynamic state administration, especially the need in the field of legislation as a basis or guideline for implementing government action to the public, the Central Government issues regulations related to the formation of legal products in the regions, whether it is legislation that is indeed ordered by the regulations above or at the same level and can also be legislation that is changed or even revoked and replaced by new regulations based on the needs at that time that are in accordance with the applicable legislation. For example, one of them is the birth of Government Regulation Number 59 of 2015 concerning the Participation of Drafters of Legislation in the Formation of Legislation and its Guidance, the formation of this government regulation as an implementation of the mandate of Article 98 paragraph (2) of Law No. 12 of 2011 which aims to:²

1. Improving the quality of legislation;
2. Increasing the role of designers in every stage of the formation of legislative regulations; And
3. To create professional human resources who have competence in the field of legislation.

However, optimizing this role is not without a number of challenges. First, the lack of coordination between local governments and related ministries or institutions often hampers the harmonization process. Second, the limited technical capacity of designers, both in terms of legal expertise and local knowledge, can affect the quality of drafting regional regulations. Third, strong political influence can cause designers to lose their independence in drafting regulations. To overcome these obstacles, several strategic steps can be taken. First, increasing the technical capacity and legal

¹ Eka N.A.M. Sihombing, *Problematika Penyusunan Program Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah (Problems On Forming Local Regulations Programs)*, *Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia*, Vol. 13, No. 03, September (2016), h. 286.

²See explanation of PP No. 59 of 2015

understanding of designers through training and certification. Second, building an effective communication and coordination system between local governments, ministries, and other stakeholders. Third, strengthening normatively binding harmonization guidelines to ensure that the harmonization process runs according to the rules. With this optimization, it is hoped that designers can play a maximum role in producing quality regional regulations, not only in terms of legal substance but also in providing a positive impact on society and regional development. This is a strategic step to create a regional legal system that is in line with the principles of the rule of law and regional autonomy.

METHOD

The method used in this study is the normative legal research method. Normative legal research that uses a statute approach *by* examining various legal rules.³ The data sources used are primary data with primary, secondary, and tertiary legal materials. The analysis used is qualitative analysis, adhering to the characteristics of legal science as an applied science. Therefore, the results of legal research, even if they are not new legal principles or new theories, are at least new arguments.

DISCUSSION

The Position Of The Drafter's Role In The Formation Of Legislative Regulations

According to A Hamid S Attamimi, in the formation of Indonesian legislation, as in other countries, there are two legal principles that need to be considered, namely the general legal principle which specifically provides guidelines and guidance for the "formation" of the contents of the regulation, and other legal principles which provide guidelines and guidance for the pouring of regulations into their form and structure, for the method of their formation, and for the process and procedures of their formation. This last legal principle can be called the principle of the formation of proper legislation.⁴ Both legal principles work hand in hand, providing simultaneous guidelines and guidance every time there is an activity of forming legislation, each according to its field.⁵

I Gde Pantja Astawa and Suprin Na'a stated that Regional Regulations are statutory regulations that are formed with the joint approval of the Regional Head and the DPRD which function to organize regional autonomy, assistance tasks,

³ Eka NAM Sihombing, Cynthia Hadita, *Penelitian Hukum* (Malang: Setara Press, 2022).

⁴ *Ibid*, page 305

⁵ Attamimi, A. Hamid S, *Peranan Keputusan Presiden Republik Indonesia Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Negara Suatu Studi Analisis Mengenai Keputusan Presiden yang Berfungsi Pengaturan dalam Kurun Waktu Pelita I-Pelita V*, Disertasi, Pascasarjana Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, 1990, p. 302

accommodate special regional conditions and further explain the statutory regulations above it.⁶

Seeing the authority given by the center to the Regional Government in managing its household, a tool is needed in the form of a legal product in the form of a regional regulation that aims to regulate and bind the community in the region so that the goals of the Regional Government can be realized. The regional regulation formed by the region must be able to accommodate by seeing the extent of the urgency of the regional regulation to be formed, so that the regional regulation formed can be accepted by all levels of society. In the context of regional autonomy, the existence of the Regional Regulation in principle plays a role in encouraging maximum decentralization.⁷

The existence of regional regulations was firmly formulated in the 1945 Constitution (second amendment) and in MPR Decree Number III/MPR/2000 concerning Sources of Law and Order of Legislation, which was then further stipulated in Law Number 10 of 2004 concerning the Formation of Legislation.⁸ In line with the development of Indonesian state administration, a number of regulations have undergone many changes to adapt to the prevailing state administration climate at that time, one of which was the birth of Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislation replacing Law No. 10 of 2004 concerning the Formation of Legislation.

Regional regulations as legal regulations in the hierarchy of legal regulations have an important role in the national legal system. Regional regulations are legal instruments in the implementation of regional autonomy to determine the direction and policies of regional development and its supporting facilities.⁹ Regional regulations are legal products that have their own characteristics because they are formed with local political conditions and the specifics of the region. The birth of a Regional Regulation must contain a regulation that can be obeyed by its people, and to support this, it is very necessary to understand the desires and social conditions of its people so that they can be implemented in the long term.¹⁰

⁶I Gde Pantja Astawa dan Suprin Na'a, *Dinamika Hukum dan Ilmu Perundang-undangan di Indonesia*, (Alumni, Bandung, 2008), hal 69. page 69. Compare with the Understanding or definition of Regional Regulation contained in Article 1 point 7 of Law Number 10 of 2004 which only mentions the authority of the institution that forms it. : "Peraturan Daerah adalah peraturan perundang-undangan yang dibentuk oleh DPRD dengan persetujuan bersama Kepala Daerah."

⁷Reny Rawasita, et.al., *Menilai Tanggung Jawab Sosial Peraturan Daerah*, Pusat Studi Hukum dan Kebijakan Indonesia (PSHK), Jakarta, 2009, p. 60.

⁸Maria Farida Indrati, <http://id.scribd.com/doc/74319357/Kedudukan-Perda-dalam-sistem-hukum-di-Negara#scribd>, accessed on 14 December 2015

⁹Muhammad Suharjono, <http://download.portalgaruda.org/article.php?article=253630&val6844&title=FORMATION%20OF%20RESPONSIVE%20REGIONAL%20REGULATIONS%20IN%20SUPPORTING%20REGIONAL%20AUTONOMY>, accessed on December 26, 2015

¹⁰ *Ibid*

Government Affairs are divided into three, namely absolute, concurrent, and general Government Affairs. Concurrent Government Affairs are Government Affairs that are divided between the Central Government and provincial and district/city areas. These concurrent Government Affairs are divided into those that are mandatory and optional to be implemented by the regional Government in the form of regional regulations. This situation makes regional regulations increasingly have a strategic position in the life of the nation and state or in other words the role of regional regulations in implementing Government Affairs becomes very large. The strategic position of regional regulations in carrying out Government Affairs can be good if the formation of the regional regulations is carried out properly and can backfire if it is not carried out properly.¹¹

The formation of regional regulations is a manifestation of the authority delegated to the Regional Government in the framework of implementing regional autonomy to exercise its rights and obligations.¹² In its formation, a series of principles have been established including clarity of purpose, appropriate institutions or forming organs, suitability between types and content materials, can be implemented, usefulness and effectiveness, clarity of formulation and openness.¹³ In addition, it must not conflict with higher laws and regulations.¹⁴ Regional Regulations are one of the tools in carrying out social and democratic transformation as a manifestation of regional communities that are able to respond to rapid changes and challenges in the current era of autonomy and globalization and the creation of *good local governance* as part of sustainable development in the region.¹⁵

In the formation of statutory regulations, stages have been established that must be passed by the organ forming statutory regulations so that the resulting statutory regulations fulfill formal aspects. Neglect of the stages that have been established can result in a legislative regulation being formally defective. The Planning Stage is the initial stage of the process of forming statutory regulations. Based on the provisions of Article 1 number 1 of Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations, it is stated that the Formation of Legislative Regulations is the creation of Legislative Regulations which includes the stages of planning, drafting, discussing, ratifying or determining, and promulgating.¹⁶

Preparing a regional regulatory program is a stage that cannot be ignored. Weaknesses in the planning aspect are one factor in the failure of the effectiveness and enforceability of regional regulations. On this basis, it is necessary to carry out stages

¹¹Rudy Hendra Pakpahan, *Pengujian Perda Oleh Lembaga Eksekutif dan Yudikatif*, tesis, p. 5

¹²Op.cit, Eka NAM Sihombing, *Paradigma Kebijakan Hukum Reformasi*, p. 189

¹³Ibid, p. 189

¹⁴Ibid, p. 189

¹⁵Siti Masitah, *Urgensi Prolegda dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah*, (Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia Volume 11 No.4 Desember 2014), p. 427.

¹⁶Eka N.A.M. Sihombing, *Op.Cit.* h 289.

in the formation of comprehensive legislation in accordance with applicable legal provisions.¹⁷

The term "designer" itself was originally known through Law no. 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations which is regulated in Article 98 paragraph (1) that "Each stage of the Formation of Legislative Regulations includes the Drafter of Legislative Regulations". The definition of the designer itself is further explained in Article 1 paragraph (1) of Government Regulation no. 59 of 2015 concerning the Participation of Legislative Drafters in the Formation of Legislative Regulations and Their Development.

At the beginning of September, Government Regulation Number 59 of 2015 concerning the Participation of Drafters of Legislative Regulations was issued, an order from Law Number 12 of 2011 as implementing regulations regarding the participation of Drafters in the formation of statutory regulations and their guidance. Previously, legislative regulations had also been issued which mandated the participation of Legislative Regulation Drafters in every formation of statutory regulations such as Presidential Decree Number 87 of 2014 and Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 80 of 2015. With the issuance of Government Regulation Number 59 of 2015, this will further strengthen the role Drafter in the formation of Regional Regulations..

Legislative drafters as stated in Article 1 number 1 of the Decree of the Minister of State for Empowerment of State Apparatus Number 41/KEP/M.PAN/12/2000 concerning the Functional Position of Drafters and their Credit Points stipulates that, Legislative Drafters are Civil Servants who are given full duties, responsibilities, authority, and rights by authorized officials to carry out activities to draft legislation and/or other legal instruments in government agencies. Meanwhile, Legislative Drafters as explained in Law Number 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislation referred to as "Legislative Drafters"¹⁸ are civil servants who are given full duties, responsibilities, authority, and rights by an official who is authorized to carry out activities to prepare Draft Legislation and/or other legal instruments in accordance with the provisions of statutory regulations .

Government Regulation Number 16 of 1994 concerning Civil Servant Functional Positions provides an understanding of Civil Servant Functional Positions, which are called functional positions, which are positions that indicate the duties, responsibilities , authorities and rights of a civil servant in an organizational unit whose duties are based on certain expertise and/or skills and are independent. A functional position group is a collection of functional positions that have functions and duties that are closely related to each other in carrying out one of the general tasks of government.¹⁹

The role and function of the Drafter is to provide expert support in every stage of the formation of the Law, starting from the planning, drafting, and discussion stages.

¹⁷ Eka N.A.M. Sihombing, *Op. Cit.* h 291

¹⁸Explanation of Law Number 12 of 2011

¹⁹Article 1 number 2 of Government Regulation Number 16 of 1994

Although having a role and function in the formation of the Law, coaching the performance and career of the Drafter still has several problems that must be immediately considered and the best solution sought so that the Drafter becomes more professional so that he can provide a more optimal contribution of expertise in supporting the legislative function. One way to optimize the role of the Drafter of Legislation must start from increasing competence both technically and substantively, then the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra carries out continuous coordination with the regional government, both Provincial and Regency/City, to include the Drafter of Legislation in the stages of the formation of regional regulations.²⁰

The drafter of the legislation has a strategic responsibility in ensuring the principles of harmonization. This principle includes vertical consistency, namely the alignment of the Regional Regulation with the legislation at the national level, and horizontal consistency, namely the integration between the Regional Regulations that apply in a region. In addition, the drafter must also consider the principles of clarity of substance, public understanding, and sustainability of legal implementation.

Optimizing the Role of Legislative Regulation Designers in Implementing Harmonization of Regional Regulation Drafts.

Harmonization of statutory regulations is the process of harmonizing (adjusting) the concept, substance and formulation of a draft statutory regulation, both in the internal part of the draft (body and explanation), with existing statutory regulations and other drafts which are also being prepared, so that forms an integrated element and is in line with other laws and regulations or not. Rounding is the process of making all elements (elements) integrated so as to form concepts, substances and formulations into a unified whole. Consolidation is the process of evaluating concepts, substances and formulations from the perspective of philosophical, juridical and sociological considerations so that the public instruments formed are believed to be strong and stable legal regulations and capable of becoming a legal basis for regulating and resolving the problems faced.²¹

Harmonization, rounding out and strengthening the conception of draft laws is intended so that the resulting legislation becomes a reliable legal product so that it is worthy of being part of the national legal system. The national legal system in question meets the following characteristics:

- a. Comply with the principles of hierarchy of laws and regulations
- b. Interrelationship and dependence between one law and other laws;
- c. There are no elements that conflict with one another;
- d. Can be tested (judicial review) both materially and formally.

²⁰Interview result with Mr. Eka NAM Sihombing, SH. M.Hum as Head of Documentation and Legal Information Sub-Division/Middle Designer, on September 23, 2015.

²¹ Ida surya dan abdul wahab, "Harmonisasi Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Dalam Mewujudkan Pemerintahan Yang Baik" *Jurnal Kompilasi Hukum*, Vol. 8 No. 2 (2023). H. 113.

- e. There is a guarantee that the process of forming statutory regulations is carried out in a principled manner for the sake of legal certainty

To achieve the above characteristics, the role of a designer is needed. A designer of legislative regulations is also required to understand and carry out his role well. The role of the Drafter of Legislative Regulations is:²²

1. determine the choices desired by policy makers.
2. formulate the substance consistently or in accordance with principles.
3. formulate substances that do not give rise to interpretation (ambiguity).
4. formulate fair, equivalent, or non-discriminatory substances.
5. ensure that the designed regulations can be easily implemented by the implementers.
6. ensure that the regulations drafted do not conflict with higher laws and regulations or violate the public interest.
7. ensure that the regulations designed can solve the problems faced by policy makers.
8. act as a mediator in resolving overlapping authority and regulations in discussions at the inter-departmental or inter-institutional level.
9. conducting negotiations or psychological approaches to policy makers in order to achieve the desired goals.

Quoting from Maria Farida's foreword that as stated by Burkahrds Krems as one of the pioneers of Legal Science, Legal Science is divided into Legal Theory (*Gezetzgebungswissenschaft/Wetgevingstheorie*) and Legal science (*Gezetzgebungslehre/Wetgevingsleer*).²³ Legal theory is cognitive and oriented towards seeking clarity and clarity of understanding, especially basic understanding in the field of legislation (including understanding of the legislators and legislation).²⁴

Sunaryati Hartono stated that the preparation of laws and regulations in the 21st century is a long-term job that is very different from the process and techniques of preparing laws and regulations in the past, because now their formation requires the involvement of people who have:²⁵

- a. a correct vision of history and nation;
- b. about the character and behavior of the nation and;
- c. about the advantages and disadvantages of our nation compared to other nations.

The drafter of legislation has a crucial and strategic role. Recognition of this role gives rise to several major responsibilities. Totality in carrying out tasks is expected

²² *Ibid*

²³ Bayu Dwi Anggono, *Perkembangan Pembentukan Undang-Undang di Indonesia*, (Jakarta: Konstitusi press, 2014), p.ix

²⁴ *Ibid* . p. x

²⁵ Sunaryati Hartono, *Pengkajian dan Penelitian Hukum dalam Menunjang Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-undangan di Daerah, Temu Konsultasi dengan Kementerian Hukum dan HAM*, Jakarta, 2012, p. 5

of each Drafter considering that their work has a major impact on people's lives. For example, inaccuracy in referring to articles during drafting can have legal consequences that are detrimental to the community, hurt the sense of justice and cause legal uncertainty and ultimately be annulled by the Constitutional Court or the Supreme Court, either in part or in full, of the contents of the Articles of the legislation.²⁶

The formation of Regional Regulations carried out by the Legislative Regulation Drafting staff as an effort to harmonize the draft Regional Regulation with the regulations above in accordance with the hierarchy of laws and regulations, so that there is no cancellation due to conflict with laws and regulations. Hierarchy is a hierarchy of each type of legislation based on the principle that lower legislation may not conflict with higher legislation. Therefore, the legal force of each of the above laws and regulations is determined based on the level of its hierarchy.²⁷

Thus, the resulting Regional Regulation is expected to be formed perfectly so that in its application in the community it can become a tool of social engineering (*law as a tool of social engineering*), which makes laws and regulations an important factor in all aspects of life. As stated by M. Solly Lubis, the regulation is considered perfect if the following requirements are met:²⁸

- a. The regulation provides justice for those concerned, for example whether workers, farmers, fishermen, street vendors, women, teachers and lecturers feel that with the presence of the legal regulation their interests will truly be protected.
- b. These legal regulations provide certainty, in the sense of legal certainty, that with the enactment of these regulations, the boundaries of the rights (*recht*, right) and obligations (*plicht*, duty) of all parties involved in a legal relationship (*rechtsbetrekkingen*) will be clear, for example in labor relations, marriage relations, work contracts, and so on.
- c. This regulation provides clear benefits for those interested in the presence of this regulation. Generally, if the two previous conditions have been met then this third condition will also be met.

Optimizing the role of regulatory drafters in harmonizing draft regional regulations (*Perda*) is an important element in creating an integrated, consistent, and responsive legal system. Drafters hold strategic responsibility to ensure that draft *Perda* does not conflict with higher regulations and is in line with community needs and regional development visions. However, various challenges, such as lack of coordination, limited technical capacity, and political pressure, are still obstacles that need to be overcome. By strengthening competence, increasing cross-sector

²⁶Kifzaya, *Loc. Cit*,

²⁷Abdul Wahid, *Op. Cit*

²⁸M. Solly Lubis, *Ilmu Pengetahuan Perundang-undangan*, (Bandung, Mandar Maju, 2009), page 45.

coordination, and enforcing harmonization guidelines, drafters can play a more optimal role in creating quality and effective Perda.

The government needs to formulate and implement stricter and more binding harmonization guidelines to ensure that the process of drafting Regional Regulations runs according to applicable legal principles. Protection is needed for drafters to avoid political intervention that can disrupt the objectivity and quality of drafting Regional Regulations. With these steps, harmonization of Regional Regulations can be carried out effectively, resulting in regulations that are in accordance with the needs of the community, support regional development, and strengthen the national legal system.

Although the Participation of Legislative Drafters is a right that has been mandated by laws and regulations, in the implementation level it is proven that local governments have not yet involved Legislative Drafters. Legislative Drafters who have duties and functions in the field of legislative drafting have an obligation to form Regional Regulations that are technically good and responsive so that they can be accepted by the community. However, there are still many obstacles experienced by Legislative Drafters in carrying out their duties and functions that can affect the performance of the Drafters not optimally.

CONCLUSION

The role of the designer in forming a statutory regulation is very important. The position and regulations regarding the function of the designer can be seen from the provisions of Law no. 12 of 2011 concerning the Formation of Legislative Regulations which is regulated in Article 98 paragraph (1) that "Each stage of the Formation of Legislative Regulations includes the Drafting of Legislative Regulations" and is followed by the presence of Government Regulation no. 59 of 2015 concerning the Participation of Legislative Drafters in the Formation of Legislative Regulations and Their Development. From this provision, it can be seen that the role of the designer in forming a legal regulation is very important and has a strategic position in order to create good legal rules.

Optimizing the role of the drafters of legislation in harmonizing draft regional regulations is urgent in realizing an integrated and responsive legal system. In carrying out this function, the drafter is tasked with ensuring that the draft Regional Regulation is not only consistent with higher legal norms, but also in line with the needs of the community and the vision of regional development. A more effective coordination system is needed between the drafter, local government, related ministries, and other stakeholders to support efficient harmonization.

REFERENCES

Anggono Bayu Dwi, *Perkembangan Pembentukan Undang-Undang di Indonesia*, Jakarta: Konstitusi press, 2014.

ISSN (Print) 2723-3413 - ISSN (Online) 2722-3663

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30596/nomoi.v5i2.21826>

- Astawa I Gde Pantja dan Suprin Na'a, *Dinamika Hukum dan Ilmu Perundang-undangan di Indonesia*, (Alumni, Bandung, 2008), hal 69. Bandingkan dengan Pengertian atau defenisi Perda yang terdapat dalam Pasal 1 butir 7 UU Nomor 10 Tahun 2004 yang hanya menyebutkan kewenangan lembaga yang membentuknya. : ”Peraturan Daerah adalah peraturan perundang-undangan yang dibentuk oleh DPRD dengan persetujuan bersama Kepala Daerah.”
- Attamimi,A. Hamid S, *Peranan Keputusan Presiden Republik Indonesia Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Negara Suatu Studi Analisis Mengenai Keputusan Presiden yang Berfungsi Pengaturan dalam Kurun Waktu Pelita I-Pelita V*, Disertasi, Pascasarjana Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, 1990, hlm. 302
- FaridaIndrati Maria, <http://id.scribd.com/doc/74319357/Kedudukan-Perda-dalam-Sistem-Hukum-di-Negara#scribd>, diakses pada tanggal pada tanggal 14 Desember 2023.
- Hartono Sunaryati, *Pengkajian dan Penelitian Hukum dalam Menunjang Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-undangan di Daerah*, Temu Konsultasi dengan Kementerian Hukum dan HAM, Jakarta, 2012.
- Lubis M. Solly, *Ilmu Pengetahuan Perundang-undangan*, Bandung, Mandar Maju, 2009.
- Masitah Siti, *Urgensi Prolegda dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah*, (Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia Volume 11 No.4 Desember 2014).
- Pakpahan Rudy Hendra, *Pengujian Perda Oleh Lembaga Eksekutif dan Yudikatif*, tesis, Rawasita Reny, et.al., *Menilai Tanggung Jawab SosialPeraturan Daerah*,Pusat Studi Hukum dan KebijakanIndonesia (PSHK), Jakarta, 2009.
- Sihombing Eka NAM, Cynthia Hadita, *Penelitian Hukum* (Malang: Setara Press, 2022).
- Sihombing Eka NAM, *Paradigma Kebijakan Hukum Reformasi, Artikel*.
- Suharjono Muhammad, <http://download.portalgaruda.org/article.php?article=253630&val=6844&title=PEMBENTUKAN%20PERATURAN%20DAERAH%20YANG%20RESPONSIF%20DALAM%20MENDUKUNG%20OTONOMI%20DAERAH>, diakses pada tanggal 26 Desember 2023.
- Surya Ida dan abdul wahab, “Harmonisasi Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Dalam Mewujudkan Pemerintahan Yang Baik” *Jurnal Kompilasi Hukum*, Vol. 8 No. 2 2023.